

INTERNAL OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

RECORD OF ACTION FOR November 9, 2020

Supervisor Candace Andersen, Chair Supervisor Diane Burgis, Vice Chair

Present: Candace Andersen, Chair

Diane Burgis, Vice Chair

Staff Julie DiMaggio Enea, Staff

Present:

Attendees: See Attendance Record, attached.

1. Introductions

Chair Andersen called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m. and introduced the Committee.

2. Public comment on any item under the jurisdiction of the Committee and not on this agenda (speakers may be limited to three minutes).

No one requested to speak during the general public comment period.

RECEIVE and APPROVE the Record of Action for the October 12, 2020 IOC meeting.

The Committee approved the Record of Action for the October 12, 2020 meeting as presented.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

4. RECOMMEND to the Board of Supervisors appointments and reappointments to the Hazardous Materials Commission. (Michael Kent, Health Services Department)

The Committee approved the appointments as recommended and directed staff to forward the recommendations to the Board of Supervisors.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen

Vice Chair Diane Burgis

5. RECOMMEND reappointment of Dean E. Barbieri to the Member of the Bar seat on the Public Law Library Board of Trustees to a new one-year term expiring on December 31, 2021.

The Committee approved the appointment as recommended and directed staff to forward the recommendation to the Board of Supervisors.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

6. RECOMMEND the reappointment of Neil Tsutsui to the Board of Supervisors Appointee seat on the East Bay Regional Parks District Park Advisory Committee for a new two-year term that will expire on December 31, 2022.

The Committee approved the appointment as recommended and directed staff to forward the recommendation to the Board of Supervisors.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

7. RECOMMEND the reappointment of Chris Cowen to the At Large 2 seat and Darryl Young to the At Large 3 seat on the Mosquito & Vector Control District Board of Trustees to new four-year terms ending on January 6, 2025.

The Committee approved the appointments as recommended and directed staff to forward the recommendations to the Board of Supervisors.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

8. RECOMMEND reappointment of Lorena Castillo of Martinez to the Director 1 seat, Renee Fernandez-Lipp of Pittsburg to the Director 3 seat, and Igor Skaredoff of Martinez to the Director 4 seat on the Contra Costa Resource Conservation District Board of Directors to new four-year terms expiring on November 30, 2024.

The Committee approved the appointments as recommended and directed staff to forward the recommendations to the Board of Supervisors.

RCD Director Igor Skaredoff commented about the gender, ethnic and geographic diversity of the RCD Board. He noted that individuals had recently signed on to become non-voting associate directors.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

9. INTERVIEW the following candidates for the At Large #3 and #4, and At Large Alternate #1 seats for four-year terms ending on December 31, 2024, and DETERMINE recommendations for Board of Supervisors consideration:

Group 1:

Jhon Arbelaez-Novak Scott Cashen Sandy Devoto Nicole Kozicki (Incumbent, At Large Alternate #1)

Group 2:

Dave Kwinter James Monroe Samantha Moy Robert Peoples

Group 3:

Catherine Rogers
John Rudolph
Felipe Solis
Bob Joe
Thomas Morehouse

The Committee interviewed 10 candidates. Candidate Sandy Devoto withdrew her application. Candidates James Monroe and John Rudolph did not participate; their candidacy was considered on the basis of their applications.

At the conclusion of the interviews, the Committee decided to recommend to the Board of Supervisors the appointments of Nicole Kozicki to the At Large 3 seat, Catherine Rogers to the At Large 4 seat, and Felipe Solis to the At Large Alternate seat, to terms that will commence on January 1, 2021 and expire on December 31, 2024.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

10. ACCEPT report on language interpretation services at Board of Supervisors meetings and PROVIDE direction to staff regarding next steps.

Chief Assistant Clerk of the Board Jami Napier presented the staff report, noting that this report is the third such report to the Committee with an additional report to the full Board over the last 18 months as this was being studied. The original intention was to put a policy and process in place when the Board moved to its new chambers; however, COVID-19

interrupted that plan.

She described how the meetings are currently being conducted using an interpreter in the Board chambers who provides consecutive interpretation for public comment. She asked for input from the Committee on the future direction both for virtual and in-person board meetings. Direction was requested with regard to the meetings and meeting agendas. Chair Andersen commented that this would be an excellent topic for the annual Board retreat in January. Vice Chair Burgis commented that in addition to serious challenges, COVID-19 also presented unique opportunities to conduct business in ways that may have increased public accessibility to board meetings.

Chair Andersen asked how much it would cost to hire someone to provide simultaneous Spanish interpretation of the entire board meeting rather than just consecutive interpretation of public comment. Chief Asst. CAO Tim Ewell advised that two interpreters are typically required to translate a full board meeting and estimated the cost to be \$2,600 per meeting or double the current cost, using the Truth Forum as a comparison. He noted that the cost represents the services of conference level accredited interpreters. Chair Andersen asked for some statistics as to how many people logged in for the Spanish interpretation of the Truth Forum and staff agreed to follow up with that information. Staff also noted that it is preferable to have the interpreter be present in the room rather than a virtual presence, and that there is not a significant cost difference to have the interpreter present. Vice Chair Burgis emphasized that the County is not attempting to be cheap or tight with money, but wants to ensure that any investment will be well utilized. She observed that the County has some legal standards for interpretation services so our interpreters must be accredited.

Chair Andersen invited public comment:

- Dick Offerman commented about the need for interpreter services, and asked that the County not use Google Translate but choose simultaneous Spanish interpretation of the entire board meeting rather than just consecutive interpretation of public comment. He also asked that any such services implemented be broadly publicized to increase usage.
- Tony Bravo commented that during previous budget discussions, the interpretation services were inaccurate and that simultaneous interpretation is important to help non-English speakers to understand what is happening during a meeting.
- Mariana Moore referenced a letter submitted to the Board on August 31 by the Budget Justice Coalition. She discussed principles of inclusion and civic participation and suggested that with any interpretation services, instruction needs to be provide to those who require those services, e.g., how long they should speak before they

- pause. She suggested that if an RFP gets issued for these services, that references from local community-based organizations be required. She also suggested good promotion of these services.
- Hector Malvido commented about the importance of inclusion and how an English-only platform undermines inclusion. He commented that the decision should not be made around cost but around community participation.
- Kristi Laughlin commented that the Board is making life and death decisions around COVID-19, eviction moratoriums and people at risk of losing their homes, and people are desperate to feel a connection and be heard about their plight. She mentioned the message of Census 2020, that everyone counts and said the Board needs to carry that message of inclusion in their governance.
- Dan Safran commented on the culture change that must occur in adopting such a policy and suggested engaging faith-based and other nonprofit organizations to help promote the new technology.
- Renee Zeimer suggested that the County could use the Census process as a model and that interpretation services in Spanish and other languages may be available within the county's community-based organizations rather than an independent third party.

Chair Andersen agreed that we want to provide not only accessibility but empowerment to participate. She asked for examples of good models. Jami Napier reported that in consultation with clerks of the board of other counties, the majority just have something on their agenda that says if you request services or need information in another language, to reach out to the clerk of the board. There are not many examples from which to draw. Some counties have indicated that they are waiting to see what Contra Costa County will do.

Tim Ewell noted that one of the important considerations with simultaneous interpretation is providing a space/place for Spanish speaking populations to listen to the meeting whether it be a live stream via the County website or a YouTube channel. Another consideration with simultaneous interpretation is how to provide listening capability once the board returns to in-person meetings in terms of headsets. Chair Andersen suggested we could run a banner on the CCTV broadcast directing the Spanish population to whatever platform the County decides to use to transmit the Spanish interpretation.

Vice Chair Burgis then mentioned a program provided by the City of Oakley in which each city department provided education in Spanish about what they do.

The Committee directed staff to develop recommendations for a six-month pilot program that encompasses the following, with the intention that the County would initiate a pilot process, promote it, and

measure how extensively it is utilized:

- Simultaneous Spanish interpretation of Board meetings
- Consecutive Spanish interpretation of public comment
- Consecutive interpretation of public comment in other languages upon advance request by a designated deadline
- Spanish translation of the board agenda only
- Translation of individual agenda items upon advance request by a designated deadline
- Modification to either the Better Government Ordinance or ramifications of backing up the internal staff submittal deadlines for agenda items and agenda publication dates.

Staff should also estimate the cost of such a pilot program, project the annual cost, and identify any operational changes or obstacles to enacting such a program.

In addition to agreeing on a pilot program, the Board can discuss how it wants to operate in this regard post-COVID-19 and whether it wants to continue to offer public comment virtually in addition to in-person once COVID restrictions are lifted.

AYE: Chair Candace Andersen Vice Chair Diane Burgis

- The December 14, 2020 has been canceled. No further meetings are scheduled for the 2020 Internal Operations Committee.
- 12. Adjourn

11.

Chair Andersen adjourned the meeting at 12:42 p.m.