



**AD HOC COMMITTEE ON
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS COMPENSATION**

**February 28, 2019
3:30 P.M.**

651 Pine Street, Room 101, Martinez

Larry Hendel, Central Labor Council of Contra Costa County, AFL-CIO
Terri Montgomery, East Bay Leadership Council
Angie Coffee, East Bay Leadership Council
Tom Hansen, Building Trades Council
Clifford Bowen, Public At Large

Facilitator: David Twa, Contra Costa County Administrator

Agenda Items:	Items may be taken out of order based on the business of the day and preference of the Committee
--------------------------	--

1. Call to Order and Introductions
2. Public comment on any item under the jurisdiction of the Committee and not on this agenda (speakers may be limited to three minutes).
3. APPROVE Record of Action from the February 20, 2019 meeting.
4. DISCUSS the Compensation of the Board of Supervisors and the methodology and process by which future increases could occur and PROVIDE direction to staff on next steps.
5. The next meeting is currently scheduled for March 11, 2019.
6. Adjourn

The Ad Hoc Committee on Board of Supervisors Compensation will provide reasonable accommodations for persons with disabilities planning to attend the Committee meetings. Contact the staff person listed below at least 72 hours before the meeting.

Any disclosable public records related to an open session item on a regular meeting agenda and distributed by the County to a majority of members of the Ad Hoc Committee on Board of Supervisors Compensation less than 96 hours prior to that meeting are available for public inspection at 651 Pine Street, 10th floor, during normal business hours.

Public comment may be submitted via electronic mail on agenda items at least one full work day prior to the published meeting time.

For Additional Information Contact:

David Twa, County Administrator
Phone (925) 335-1080, Fax (925) 646-1353
david.twa@cao.cccounty.us

Contra Costa County
Administrator's Office
Committee Report



**AD HOC COMMITTEE ON BOARD OF
SUPERVISORS COMPENSATION**

Meeting Date: 02/28/2019
SUBJECT: APPROVE Record of Action from the February 20, 2019 meeting.
FROM: Ad Hoc Committee On BOS Compensation,
DEPARTMENT: County Administrator
PRESENTER: **CONTACT:** David Twa, (925) 335-1080

History:

County Ordinance requires that each County body keep a record of its meetings. Thought the record need not be verbatim, it must accurately reflect the agenda and the decisions made in the meeting.

Update:

Attached for the Committee's consideration is the Record of Action for the February 20, 2019 meeting.

Recommendation(s)/Next Step(s):

APPROVE the Record of Action from the February 20, 2019 meeting.

Attachments

Record of Action, 2-20-19

**AD HOC COMMITTEE ON
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS COMPENSATION**

Record of Action

February 20, 2019

3:00 P.M.

651 Pine Street, Room 101, Martinez

Larry Hendel, Central Labor Council of Contra Costa County, AFL-CIO
Terri Montgomery, East Bay Leadership Council
Angie Coffee, East Bay Leadership Council
Tom Hansen, Building Trades Council
Clifford Bowen, Public At Large

Facilitator: David Twa, Contra Costa County Administrator

Agenda Items:

Items may be taken out of order based on the business of the day and preference of the Committee

The Ad Hoc Committee on Board of Supervisors Compensation convened at 3:04 PM on February 20, 2019. Clifford Bowen, Tom Hansen, Terri Montgomery, and Angie Coffee were in attendance. Larry Hendel was absent.

The Committee received no public comment.

The Committee approved the record of action of the February 12, 2019 meeting.

The Committee heard a report from Lisa Driscoll, Contra Costa County Finance Director, on the process for data collection, assumptions, and comments provided from Counties that responded to the Comparison of Compensation to Peer Counties.

The Committee reviewed the attachments to the February 20, 2019 meeting agenda and requested that staff return with the Comparison of Compensation to Peer Counties updated to reflect the most recent responses from the relevant Counties.

The Committee discussed whether to tie the Board of Supervisors salary to a certain percentile of the average of the comparable Counties. The Chair read a statement from Larry Hendel requesting to tie the salaries to the median of the comparable Counties, study which compensation elements to include in the comparison, and possibly phase in the approved formula over a number of years. Staff was directed to return with materials showing different combinations of compensation elements as they pertain to the average and median of the comparable Counties.

The Committee voted to change the time for the February 28, 2019 meeting to 3:30 PM.

The Committee adjourned at 4:00 PM.

The Ad Hoc Committee on Board of Supervisors Compensation will provide reasonable accommodations for persons with disabilities planning to attend the Committee meetings. Contact the staff person listed below at least 72 hours before the meeting.

Any disclosable public records related to an open session item on a regular meeting agenda and distributed by the County to a majority of members of the Ad Hoc Committee on Board of Supervisors Compensation less than 96 hours prior to that meeting are available for public inspection at 651 Pine Street, 10th floor, during normal business hours.

Public comment may be submitted via electronic mail on agenda items at least one full work day prior to the published meeting time.

For Additional Information Contact:

David Twa, County Administrator
Phone (925) 335-1080, Fax (925) 646-1353
david.twa@cao.cccounty.us

Contra Costa County
Administrator's Office
Committee Report



**AD HOC COMMITTEE ON BOARD OF
SUPERVISORS COMPENSATION**

Meeting Date: 02/28/2019

SUBJECT: Discuss the Compensation of the Board of Supervisors and the methodology and process by which future increases could occur

FROM: Ad Hoc Committee On BOS Compensation,

DEPARTMENT: County Administrator

PRESENTER: David Twa, County Administrator **CONTACT:** David Twa, (925) 335-1080

History:

The Ad Hoc Committee at the February 5 meeting, directed staff to use Alameda, Marin, Napa, Sacramento, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Santa Cruz, Solano and Sonoma as comparable Counties and directed staff to bring back to the Committee a history of salaries and wages for County Supervisors, Superior Court Judges, and major Contra Costa County Unions over the past several years. The Committee further directed staff to do a comparison of compensation for the aforementioned Counties that follows the format used in the 2015 compensation study.

Update:

Further updates have been made to the Comparison of Compensation to Peer Counties (attached). Also attached is a report of certain compensation elements as they compare to the average and median amounts for the comparable Counties as well as a summary of phased-in salary adjustment scenarios tied to judicial pay.

Recommendation(s)/Next Step(s):

PROVIDE direction to staff on next steps.

Attachments

Meeting materials

**UPDATED 2-22-19
COMPARISON OF COMPENSATION TO PEER COUNTIES**

	Alameda	Contra Costa	Marin	Napa*	Sacramento	San Mateo	Santa Clara*	Santa Cruz*	Solano*	Sonoma
Annual Salary	\$ 165,939	\$ 116,841	\$ 124,454	\$ 97,676	\$ 114,083	\$ 146,908	\$ 165,939	\$ 128,846	\$ 109,935	\$ 155,568
Other Pay (Transparent CA)	\$ 7,903	\$ 7,200	\$ 13,428	\$ 9,380	\$ 10,434	\$ 13,235	\$ 4,800	\$ 4,210	\$ 34,256	\$ 24,608
Auto Allowance/Mileage	Mileage	\$ 7,200	\$ 9,600	\$ 5,280	not available	\$ 13,338	not available	None	\$ 10,400	not available
Deferred Compensation	None	\$ 13,020	None	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,141	None	\$ 18,500	None	\$ 1,319	\$ 1,556
Average Employee FY 2018-19 Contribution Rates (Entry Age 40 for non-PERS plans)	8.54%	12.22%	10.34%	8.10%	10.86%	8.52%	3.93%	7.00%	7.00%	11.93%
Employee Pension Contribution (based on Salary only)	\$ 14,171	\$ 14,278	\$ 12,869	\$ 7,912	\$ 12,389	\$ 12,517	\$ 6,523	\$ 9,019	\$ 7,695	\$ 18,559
County Health Contribution - Kaiser Family Coverage (2018)	\$ 21,205	\$ 18,539	\$ 20,410	\$ 21,169	\$ 17,439	\$ 18,824	\$ 15,033	\$ 24,048	\$ 18,577	\$ 18,704
Annual Pension Benefit: Based on 8 years service and age 55	\$ 19,806	\$ 18,695	\$ 19,913	\$ 19,535	\$ 17,770	\$ 22,918	\$ 33,188	\$ 20,615	\$ 23,746	\$ 31,114
Pension Formula & Vesting	Tier 2A is 1.492% @ 55; Tier 4 is 1.3% @ 55, 3 year FAC period	Tier 1 & 3 Enhanced is 2% @ 55, up to 3% COLA, 1 year FAC period	General Classic Tier 3A 2% @ 55, up to 2% COLA, 3 year FAC period	CalPERS Tier 1 2.5% @ 55, and Tier 2 2% @ 60.	Tier 3 - 1.947% @ 55; up to 2% COLA, 5 years to vest	Plan 4 hired before 8/7/11 - 2% @ 55.5, up to 2% COLA, 3 year FAC period	CalPERS Classic - 2.5% @ 55	Tier 1 - CalPERS 2% @ 55, 1 year FAC period; Tier 2 2% @ 60, 3 year FAC	CalPERS Hired 5/4/12 to 1/1/2013 - 2% @ 60; Hired prior to 5/4/12 - 2.7% @ 55	Plan A 2.5% @ 55; 1 year FAC period
Public Employees Pension Reform Act of 2013	2% at age 62 for new non-safety members with an early retirement age of 52 and a maximum benefit factor of 2.5% at age 67									
Retirement System Assumed Rate of Return	7.25%	7.00%	7.00%	7.25% for FY 2018-19 rate, lowered to 7.00% in FY 19-20	7.00%	7% for FY 2018-19 rates, lowered to 6.75 for FY 2019-20	7.25% for FY 2018-19 rate, lowered to 7.00% in FY 19-20	7.25% for FY 2018-19 rate, lowered to 7.00% in FY 19-20	7.25% for FY 2018-19 rate, lowered to 7.00% in FY 19-20	7.25%
County Pension Rate	not available	29.63%	21.69%	20.99%	18.54%	32.71%	not available	21.36%	22.94%	18.95%
Retiree Health	County provides none. However, ACERA provides partial benefits with 10 years svc credit.	Capped - Kaiser rate is \$1,115.84 per month for Family. No subsidy if hired after 12/31/08.	Capped, based on hire date and years of service. Hired on or after 1/1/08 using Plan 4 - Max subsidy formula - years of service (up to 20) x \$150 (max subsidy of \$250 per month).	Subsidy to health premium of lowest cost active, and may convert accumulated sick leave to credit for retiree's portion of monthly premium. (8 hours of sick leave = one month of retiree health insurance premium.)	\$650/annually while an active employee	Sick leave does not get added to retirement base. Banked sick leave can be "spent" on retiree health premiums. 8 hours buys one month of retiree health.	For most retirees, the County pays for single coverage under the Kaiser retiree-only health plan. Employees hired after 2012 must have 15 years of service. Board members pay approximately \$62.21 every two weeks while active towards the benefit (20% of lowest cost plan premium).	Premium minus the PEMHCA Minimum, which is \$133 for 2018.	If eligible, retiree pays PEMHCA minimum (currently \$136 per month). Accumulated unused sick leave accruals paid into RHS account. Account may only be used for health care-related expenses.	County contributes to HRA only while an active employee. (No post retirement contribution) All Board members elected as of Jan. 1, 2009 receive \$2400 contribution to an HRA after 2 years of service. Then, \$110 per month contribution after that, as long as they remain in active status.

*CalPERS Members - classic member FY 2018/19 contribution rates. These items have been updated since 2-15-19

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O	P	Q	R	S	T	U	V
1	TOTAL COMPENSATION																				
2	22-Feb-19																				
3																					
4		POPULATION	BUDGET¹	ANNUAL SALARY	OTHER PAY	AUTO ALLOWANCE	DEFERRED COMP	TOTAL ALL COLUMNS	TOTAL WITHOUT AUTO	EE PENSION CONTRIBUTION	ANNUAL PENSION BENEFIT	KAISER A FAMILY COVERAGE									
5																					
6																					
7	ALAMEDA	1,660,202	\$ 3,996.8	\$ 165,939	\$ 7,903	\$ 9,600	\$ 18,500	\$ 173,842	\$ 173,842	\$ 14,171	\$ 19,806	\$ 21,205									
8	MARIN	263,886	\$ 766.6	\$ 124,454	\$ 13,428	\$ 9,600	\$ 18,500	\$ 147,482	\$ 137,882	\$ 12,869	\$ 19,913	\$ 20,410									
9	NAPA	141,294	\$ 494.4	\$ 97,676	\$ 9,380	\$ 5,280	\$ 1,141	\$ 113,336	\$ 108,056	\$ 7,912	\$ 19,535	\$ 21,169									
10	SACRAMENTO	1,529,501	\$ 4,298.4	\$ 114,083	\$ 10,434	\$ 13,338	\$ 1,556	\$ 125,658	\$ 125,658	\$ 12,389	\$ 17,770	\$ 17,439									
11	SAN MATEO	774,155	\$ 2,667.4	\$ 146,908	\$ 13,235	\$ 10,400	\$ 18,500	\$ 173,481	\$ 160,143	\$ 11,978	\$ 21,932	\$ 18,824									
12	SANTA CLARA	1,956,598	\$ 8,868.1	\$ 165,939	\$ 4,800	\$ 9,655	\$ 4,703	\$ 189,239	\$ 189,239	\$ 6,523	\$ 33,188	\$ 15,033									
13	SANTA CRUZ	276,864	\$ 821.6	\$ 128,846	\$ 4,210	\$ 10,400	\$ 1,319	\$ 133,056	\$ 133,056	\$ 8,820	\$ 20,160	\$ 24,048									
14	SOLANO	439,793	\$ 1,093.8	\$ 109,935	\$ 34,256	\$ 10,400	\$ 1,556	\$ 155,910	\$ 145,510	\$ 7,695	\$ 23,746	\$ 18,577									
15	SONOMA	503,332	\$ 1,679.6	\$ 155,568	\$ 24,608	\$ 9,655	\$ 4,703	\$ 181,732	\$ 181,732	\$ 18,559	\$ 31,114	\$ 18,704									
16																					
17	9 County Average	838,403	\$ 2,743.0	\$ 134,372	\$ 13,584	\$ 9,655	\$ 4,703	\$ 154,860	\$ 150,569	\$ 11,213	\$ 23,018	\$ 19,490									
18	Median (50 percentile)	503,332	\$ 1,679.6	\$ 128,846	\$ 10,434			\$ 155,910	\$ 145,510	\$ 11,978	\$ 20,160	\$ 18,824									
19																					
20	CONTRA COSTA	1,149,363	\$ 4,098.0	\$ 116,841	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200	\$ 13,020	\$ 144,261	\$ 137,061	\$ 14,278	\$ 18,695	\$ 18,539									
21																					
22	Amount Below Average	(310,960)	\$ (1,355)	\$ 17,531	\$ 6,384	\$ 2,455	\$ (8,317)	\$ 10,599	\$ 13,508	\$ (3,065)	\$ 4,323	\$ 951									
23	Percent below Average	-37.1%	-49.4%	13.0%	47.0%	25.4%	-176.8%	6.8%	9.0%	-27.3%	18.8%	4.9%									
24																					
25	Amount Below Median	(646,031)	\$ (2,418)	\$ 12,005	\$ 3,234			\$ 11,649	\$ 8,449	\$ (2,300)	\$ 1,465	\$ 285									
26	Percent Below Median	-128.4%	-144.0%	9.3%	31.0%			7.5%	5.8%	-19.2%	7.3%	1.5%									
27																					
28	¹ in millions																				

	A	B	C	D	E	F
1	PHASED IN SCENARIOS					
2						
3		SALARY		SALARY &		
4		ONLY		OTHER PAY¹		
5						
6	9 COUNTY AVERAGE	\$ 134,372		\$ 150,569		
7						
8	Contra Costa	\$ 116,841		\$ 116,841		
9	Deferred Comp	\$ -		\$ 13,020		
10	Auto	\$ -		\$ 7,200		
11	TOTAL	\$ 116,841		\$ 137,061		
12						
13	DIFFERENCE	\$ 17,531		\$ 13,508		
14						
15						
16	JUDGES SALARY	\$ 207,424				
17						
18	60%	\$ 124,454				
19	65%	\$ 134,826				
20	70%	\$ 145,197				
21						
22	IF PHASED IN		plus assumed Judges increases of 3% per year			
23		year one	year two	year three	year four	year five
24	60%	\$ 124,454	\$ 128,188	\$ 132,034	\$ 135,995	\$ 140,075
25	63%	\$ 130,677	\$ 134,597	\$ 138,635	\$ 142,794	\$ 147,078
26	65%	\$ 134,826	\$ 138,870	\$ 143,036	\$ 147,328	\$ 151,747
27	68%	\$ 141,048	\$ 145,280	\$ 149,638	\$ 154,127	\$ 158,751
28	70%	\$ 145,197	\$ 149,553	\$ 154,039	\$ 158,660	\$ 163,420
29						
30	¹ Other Pay as reported by Transparent CA (includes any auto allowance) plus any reported deferred compensation contribution					