Residential Parking Analysis for Sequoia Grove Compared to Other Habitat for Humanity Developments

123 A Street, Hayward December 11, 2014

Habitat for Humanity East Bay/Silicon Valley, Inc. ("Habitat") has compared available data in three of its previous and current developments to that of Sequoia Grove. Because of this comparison and our experiences with the specific needs of the population we serve, we believe that eliminating one parking space from the City's requirement is justified for our very low and low income populations.

Affordable Homeownership Development Comparison:

Habitat has recently completed construction on three multi-family style developments with parking ratios that are lower than at Sequoia Grove. The total number of on-site parking spaces provided for these developments includes both resident parking and guest parking. There have been few reported issues in regard to the amount of parking provided at these developments. The following developments have a mix of two-, three-, and four-bedroom homes and an income mix similar to Sequoia Grove:

<u>Kinsell Commons at Tassafaronga Village</u>: Completed in 2010, this is a development of 22 for-sale affordable townhomes in Oakland. Buyers are very low and low income. 22 parking spaces are provided on site, which includes guest parking.

<u>Brookfield Court</u>: Completed in 2014, this is a development of 12 for-sale affordable townhomes in Oakland. Buyers are very low and low income. 22 parking spaces are provided on site. Three- and four-bedroom homes are assigned two parking spaces and two-bedroom homes are assigned one space. These assignments include guest parking.

<u>Pleasant Creek Homes</u>: Completed in 2014, this is a development of 10 for-sale affordable townhomes in Walnut Creek. Buyers are very low, low, and moderate income. 18 parking spaces are provided on site. Three- and four-bedroom homes are assigned two parking spaces and two-bedroom homes are assigned one space. These assignments include guest parking.

Kinsell Commons		Brookfield Court		Pleasant Creek Homes		Sequoia Grove		
Oakland		Oakland		Walnut Creek		Hayward		
Townhomes		Townhomes		Townhomes		Townhomes		
Two and Three Bedrooms		Two, Three, and Four Bedrooms		Two, Three, and Four Bedrooms		Three and Four Bedrooms		
Complet	Completed 2010		Completed 2014		Completed 2014		Pre-Construction	
Homes	Parking Spaces	Homes	Parking Spaces	Homes	Parking Spaces	Homes	Parking Spaces	
22	22	12	22	10	18	10	20	
1:1		1.83:1		1.8:1		2:1		

Sequoia Grove Parking Needs:

Habitat's Sequoia Grove development includes 20 on-site surface parking spaces serving a total of 10 homes, a parking ratio of 2:1. This allows Habitat to provide each home with two parking spaces. Habitat has also included bike racks for eight bike parking spaces.

Habitat's experience with previous developments indicates that on-site parking ratios of 1:83 or lower have been adequate to serve Habitat's partner families. Habitat's partner families typically include many single-parent households that only own a single car. In addition, the working members of many of these families work nights or weekends, which alleviates pressure on parking during times when parking demand is typically highest.

The Sequoia Grove development will serve lower families earning between 40% and 80% of Area Median Income (AMI) (\$36,800 – 67,600 for a family of four). Half of these families will earn less than 50% AMI (\$46,000 for a family of four). Our experience indicates that many of our partners families, especially those earning less than 50% AMI, have a difficult time affording the costs of purchasing and owning a car, which includes insurance, registration, vehicle maintenance, and other expenses. As a result, many choose to take the bus or walk to destinations.

Sequoia Grove's proximity to public transit also reduces the need for additional on-site parking. Several bus lines which provide regular service to destinations in and around Hayward can be found within a couple blocks from the site. The Hayward Amtrak station is also less than two blocks from the site, and the Hayward BART station is approximately one mile from the site. Several options for public transit are easily accessible from the site and within walking distance.

Surface Parking:

Carports would also create a visual barrier between the Sequoia Grove homes and the surrounding community, and would make the development look less open and visually welcoming. Kinsell Commons, Brookfield Court, and Pleasant Creek Homes all featured uncovered surface parking, and this has not been an issue for the residents and surrounding community. Carports located in front of the rectangular gathering space with picnic tables would visually cut off this attractive space from the majority of the development. Carports in front of the five existing redwood trees would do little to



Kinsell Commons

screen cars from A Street, as the parking spaces are already screened by the landscaped berm and the carport footings may exacerbate the already tight space around the roots of the existing redwood trees and could contribute to the deterioration of the health of these beautiful trees.

Please note that carports cost approximately \$10,000 per parking space. With 20 parking spaces, this would significantly impact the development costs. As a non-profit affordable housing developer,

Habitat prefers to utilize as much of its development funds as possible for its high quality home construction rather than automobile structures.

Conclusion:

After comparing Sequoia Grove to other similar Habitat developments, Habitat is confident that the number of parking spaces proposed is sufficient to meet the needs of our buyers and their guests. Habitat believes that the site layout we have proposed creates a sustainable balance between homes, parking, and open space.



Brookfield Court

Residential Parking Analysis for Central Commons Compared to Other Habitat for Humanity Developments

4369 Central Avenue, Fremont September 4, 2014

Habitat for Humanity East Bay/Silicon Valley, Inc. ("Habitat") has compared available data in three of its previous and current developments to that of Central Commons. Because of this comparison and our experiences with the specific needs of the population we serve, we believe that existing parking ratios used for typical market rate developments are unnecessarily high for our very low and low income populations.

Affordable Homeownership Development Comparison:

Habitat has recently completed or is finishing construction on three multi-family style developments with parking ratios that are the same or lower parking ratio than Central Commons. The total number of on-site parking spaces provided for these developments includes both resident parking and guest parking. There have been few reported issues in regard to the amount of parking provided at these developments. The following developments have a similar mix of two-, three-, and four-bedroom homes and an income mix similar to Central Commons:

<u>Kinsell Commons at Tassafaronga Village</u>: Completed in 2010, this is a development of 22 for-sale affordable townhomes in Oakland. Buyers are very low and low income. 22 parking spaces are provided on site, which includes guest parking.

<u>Brookfield Court</u>: Completed in 2014, this is a development of 12 for-sale affordable townhomes in Oakland. Buyers are very low and low income. 22 parking spaces are provided on site. Three- and four-bedroom homes are assigned two parking spaces and two-bedroom homes are assigned one space. These assignments include guest parking.

<u>Pleasant Creek Homes</u>: Under construction now, this is a development of 10 for-sale affordable townhomes in Walnut Creek. Buyers are very low, low, and moderate income. 18 parking spaces are provided on site. Three- and four-bedroom homes are assigned two parking spaces and two-bedroom homes are assigned one space. These assignments include guest parking. Although this development is still under construction, buyers for all homes have been identified.

Kinsell Commons		Brookfield Court		Pleasant Creek Homes		4369 Central Avenue	
Oakland		Oakland		Walnut Creek		Fremont	
Townhomes		Townhomes		Townhomes		Condominiums	
Two and Three Bedrooms		Two, Three, and Four Bedrooms		Two, Three, and Four Bedrooms		Two, Three, and Four Bedrooms	
Completed 2009		Completed 2014		Under Construction		Pre-Construction	
Homes	Parking Spaces	Homes	Parking Spaces	Homes	Parking Spaces	Homes	Parking Spaces
22	22	12	22	10	18	30	55
1:1		1.83:1		1.8:1		1.83:1	

Central Commons Parking Needs:

Habitat's Central Commons development includes 55 on-site parking spaces serving a total of 30 homes, a parking ratio of 1.83:1. This includes 40 garage spaces for residents and 15 surface parking spaces for guests. This allows Habitat to provide each four bedroom home, and the two accessible three bedroom homes, with 2 garage parking spaces. Each two bedroom and non-accessible three bedroom receives 1 garage parking space. Habitat has also included bike racks for 10 bike parking spaces and has additional room to fit more bike racks throughout the site.

Habitat's experience with previous developments indicates that on-site parking ratios of 1:83 or lower have been adequate to serve Habitat's partner families. Habitat's partner families typically include many single-parent households that only own a single car. In addition, the working members of many of these families work nights or weekends, which alleviates pressure on parking during times when parking demand is typically highest.

The Central Commons development will serve lower families earning between 40% and 80% of Area Median Income (AMI) (\$35,000 – 67,600 for a family of four). Half of these families will earn less than 50% AMI (\$46,000 for a family of four). Our experience indicates that many of our partners families, especially those earning less than 50% AMI, have a difficult time affording the costs of purchasing an owning a car, which includes insurance, registration, vehicle maintenance, and other expenses. As a result, many choose to take the bus or walk to destinations.

Central Commons' proximity to public transit also reduces the need for additional on-site parking. Fremont Boulevard is less than a half mile from the site and has several bus lines which provide regular service to destinations in and around Fremont, including shopping centers, schools, parks, and the Fremont Bart station. The Fremont Amtrak/Ace station is also approximately half a mile from the site.

Conclusion:

After comparing Central Commons to other similar Habitat developments, Habitat is confident that the number of parking spaces proposed is sufficient to meet the needs of our buyers and their guests. Habitat believes that the site layout we have proposed creates a sustainable balance between homes, parking, and open space and will not exacerbate the existing parking issues in the surrounding neighborhood.

Parking Survey – Family affordable housing in moderate density/transit accessible locations:

1/7/09 Jim Bergdoll, and Struthers Dias Architects

Oakland Recent Projects

Gateway Commons – first time homebuyer affordable housing – **1.6:1** parking ratio San Pablo Ave. at Emeryville; 2 and 3 Bedroom units

Jingletown Homes – first time homebuyer affordable housing – **1.6:1** parking ratio, clustered 29th Avenue nr International (nr Fruitvale); 2 and 3 Bedroom units

Mandela Gateway Townhome – affordable home ownership - units have **one car garages**, additional on-street parking only – Mandela Pkwy. at 8th Street; 3 bedroom units, some condos.

Sausal Creek -- 17 first time homebuyer townhomes by EBALDC, **1.1:1** parking ratio; near upper Fruitvale Avenue, Oakland.

Lion Creek (Colisseum gardens) Phase I – affordable family rentals (1-5 bedroom units) – 1:1 parking East Oakland near Colisseum.

Lion Creek Phase IV – affordable family rentals (1-3 bedroom units)– 1:1 parking ratio utilizing parking stackers

Other Projects

Sycamore Street Co-Op (Santa Cruz) – affordable rental (2-4 bedroom units) – 1.6:1 parking ratio

Habitat NYC, New York – all projects even in suburbs, goal is to provide **No parking**. Homebuyers are used to using transit and not having parking.