Table 1. COMPARISON OF POTENTIAL BENEFITS OF COLLECTION SYSTEM OPTIONS

Unregulated Open-Market System (EXISTING - 2015)	Collection System Options	Ability to Generate Additional Fees	Additional AB 939 Diversion Opportunities	Impact on Illegal Dumping <sup>(1)</sup>	Potential Impact to Rate Payers	Ease of Administration	
Unregulated Open-Market System (EXISTING - 2015)  Regulated Open-Market Permit System With Limited Permit Requirements  Regulated Open-Market Open-Market Options  Can establish and collect permit fees (leased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Regulated Open-Market Non-Exclusive Franchise with No Limit on the Number of Franchise With No Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Can establish and collect franchise fees (loased on tomage, gross revenues or other factors)  Can establish and			Open-Market O	ptions			
Unregulated Open-Market System (EXISTING - 2015)  D D D May be reduced relative to Unregulated Open-Market Permit System With Limited Permit Requirements  (PROPOSED ORDINANCE)  B Can establish and collect franchise franchise Whon-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on somega, goas revenues or offer factors)  A B Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on somega, goas revenues or offer factors)  A B Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  None  May be reduced relative to Unregulated Open-Market Options  Rates likely to be relative to Unregulated Open-Market Options as a result of greater regulatory oversight.  Rates likely to be relative to Introduced to certified facilities of the result of greater regulatory oversight.  Rates likely to be relative to Open-Market Options due to Stricter Operation of the Number of Non-Exclusive Hauler  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Non-Exclusive Franchise due to leak of the market options due to Iranchise relative to Open-Market Options due to Stricter Operation of the Number of Non-Exclusive Franchise due to leak of the market options due to Iranchise relative to Open-Market Options due to Stricter Operation of the Number of Non-Exclusive on Iranchise fees  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Non-Exclusive Franchise due to lack of the market option of the Number of Non-Exclusive on Iranchise fees  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive on Iranchise	Traditional Open-Market Options						
Regulated Open-Market Permit System With Limited Permit Requirements  (PROPOSED ORDINANCE)  Regulated Open-Market Permit System With Erhanced Permit Requirements  (PROPOSED ORDINANCE)  Regulated Open-Market Permit System With Erhanced Permit Requirements  Regulated Open-Market Permit Requirements  Regulated Open-Market Permit Respective for Closed-Market Options  Can establish and collect franchise Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect fr	Market System	None	None	to other options if unregulated "fringe haulers" illegally dump	rates for some	None	
Regulated Open-Market Permit System With Limited Permit Requirements  (PROPOSED ORDINANCE)  B  B  B  B  B  B  B  B  B  B  B  B  B	(EXISTING 2010)	D	D	D	Α	Α	
Enhanced Regulated Open-Market Options  Regulated Open-Market Permit System with Enhanced Permit System with Enhanced Permit Requirements  Regulated Open-Market Permit Requirements  Can establish and collect permit fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  Regulated Open-Market Non-Exclusive Franchise with No Limit on the Number of Franchise d Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  B  Can establish and collect permit fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  B  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  B  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  B  C  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  B  C  Rates likely to be relatively higher than Open-Market Options  Way be reduced regulation oversight requirements  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Can establish and collect franchise fees with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Can establish and collect franchise fees with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Can establish and collect franchise fees with a Single Exclusive Franchise due to lack of market pressures; but less so if competitively bid.	Market Permit System With Limited Permit Requirements	permit fees (e.g., set amount and/or fee	be diverted but	relative to Unregulated Open- Market System as a result of greater	rates relative to Closed-Market	Low	
Regulated Open-Market Permit System with Enhanced Permit Requirements  Regulated Open-Market Permit Requirements  Can establish and collect permit fees (based on tornage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  Regulated Open-Market Non-Exclusive Franchise with No Limit on the Number of Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on tornage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  Can establish and collect franchise fees (based on tornage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees of that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels Options  A  B  C  Rates likely to be relatively higher than Open-Market Options due to Permit requirements  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees of that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can establish and collect franchise requirements  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise requirements  Can establish and collect franchise requirements  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can establish and collect franchise requirements  Can	(PROPOSED ORDINANCE)	В	В	В	В	В	
Regulated Open-Market Permit System with Enhanced Permit Requirements  A  Regulated Open-Market Non-Exclusive Franchise with No Limit on the Number of Franchised Haulers  Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Naulers  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  A  A  B  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels to Open-Market Options due to Spen-Market Options due to Spen-Mark	Enhanced Regulated Open-Market Options						
revenues or other factors)  A B C D  Closed-Market With a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and single Exclusive Hauler  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require ments that may eliminate "fringe haulers"  Can establish and collect franchise requirements that may eliminate "fringe haulers"  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can establish and collect franchise requirements  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and	Permit System with Enhanced Permit Requirements  Regulated Open-Market	permit fees (based on tonnage, gross revenues or other factors)  A  Can establish and collect franchise	diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities	relative to Unregulated Open- Market System as a result of greater	relatively higher than Open-Market Options due to Permit	Highest	
Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities be delivered to certified facilities be delivered to certified facilities be delivered to ce	on the Number of	revenues or other factors)		В	С	D	
Closed-Market with a Limited Number of Non-Exclusive Franchised Haulers  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require ments  Can require ments  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require ments that may eliminate "fringe haulers"  High of the competitively bid.	Closed-Market Options						
Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can establish and collect franchise fees  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Can require minimum diversion levels or that material be delivered to certified facilities  Rates may be somewhat higher than Non-Exclusive Franchise due to lack of market pressures; but less so if competitively bid.	Limited Number of Non- Exclusive Franchised		diversion levels or that material be delivered	relative to Open- Market Options due to stricter operating requirements that may eliminate "fringe	relatively higher than Open-Market Options due to Franchise	Highest	
Closed-Market with a Single Exclusive Hauler  CEXCLUSIVE FRANCHISE)  Collect franchise fees material be delivered to certified facilities material be delivered to certified facilities material be delivered to certified facilities requirements that may eliminate "fringe haulers"  Rates may be somewhat higher than Non-Exclusive Franchise due to lack of market pressures; but less so if competitively bid.					С	D	
(EXCLUSIVE FRANCHISE)	Single Exclusive Hauler				somewhat higher than Non-Exclusive Franchise due to lack of market pressures; but less so if	High	
	(EXCLUSIVE FRANCHISE)	Α	Α	В	С	С	

<sup>(1)</sup> Greater regulatory control would be expected to reduce any illegal dumping by certain "fringe haulers" assuming they no longer operated, but any associated increase in rates may result in increased illegal dumping by waste generators.

Legend					
Most Preferable Option	Α				
More Favorable	В				
Less Favorable	С				
Least Preferable Option	D				

NOTE: Information contained in this Table will be supplemented by County staff in the report to be provided to the Board of Supervisors in November 2017.

SOURCE: 2012 Consultant Report